The Body in Pain Ca. 1400: Solomon de Piera and the Chief Rabbi's Toothache

Eleazar Gutwirth
Department of Jewish History
Tel-Aviv University
P.O. Box 39040, Tel Aviv 6997801, Israel
Email: gutwirth@tauex.tau.ac.il

Abstract:

Ancient authors paid attention to, meditated and articulated their observations on, the theme of teeth in Hebrew and Aramaic texts. In the Middle Ages, the theme of toothache appears in Hebrew texts written in Spain around 1400. The article reconstructs the historiography on the subject and questions it. It offers a reading of a poem on toothache by Shlomo de Piera and contextualizes it in the frame of European and Spanish representations of pain in the late Middle Ages.

Keywords: Jews in Spain, Representations of pain, Meir Alguadex, Shlomo de Piera, Myths of decline

Ancient authors paid attention to, meditated and articulated their observations on, the theme of teeth in Hebrew and Aramaic texts.[1] In the Middle Ages, the theme of toothache appears in Hebrew texts written in Spain around 1400. The site is the poetry of Shelomo b. Meshulam de Piera. Although a leading poet and teacher of poetry of his generation, much of his poetry still needs a great deal of study.[2] He is associated geographically with the Crown of Aragon in Northeastern Spain and socially with prominent personages of the Jewish community to whom he dedicated his poems. In some cases, he was their tutor and had taught them the art of reading and writing Hebrew poetry and literary prose. His prestige and influence did not wane for centuries.[3] Nevertheless, nineteenth century critics, using organicist metaphors, wrote about the Hebrew poetry of his age, the late Middle Ages in Spain, as an era of decline. Graetz for example maintained that:

> The Jewish sons of Spain were not so well suited for the study of narrow Talmudism as the German Jews. Prevented from occupying themselves with science, they lost their buoyancy of spirit, and became unfit for the studies permitted. Even their pleasure in song and their poetical talents died away. *Occasionally a poem was still produced, but it consisted merely of rude and unimaginative rhymes...*
>
> Indifference to scientific work resulted in so general an ignorance, that what formerly every tyro was familiar with now passed for transcendent wisdom. We have an example of *the mawkishness to which the new Hebrew poetry had fallen* in the verses of the poetaster Zarak (Zerach) Barfat, who, in a poetical paraphrase of the book of Job, completely marred the beauties of that work of art...

> *Neo-Hebraic poetry, which had blossomed so profusely on Spanish soil, faded and drooped*. Of those who cultivated it during this period only a few are remembered—Solomon Dafiera, [!] ...[4]

The twentieth century critics still adhered to such views. The very depths of literary decadence were located in de Piera's poetry because of his realism. Particularly targeted was his poem on toothache:[5]

> This "realistic" low image is absolutely in tune with the spirit of Shelomoh de Piera's poetry...In other cases he sings in a language hardly less exalted about the pain in his...teeth.

The "low" quality of De Piera's poetry is asserted without hesitation in formulations which have an air of extreme subjectivity. The question of the appearance of the toothache poetry in these late medieval surroundings is only one, concrete and well-defined area where curious peculiarities of some strands of twentieth century criticism make themselves manifest. They are, however, not untypical of the approach as a whole. In the following lines some attempts to [re]read the texts, recreate contexts and compare critical reactions to parallel literary treatments will be made.

I. Critical heritage

Late twentieth century criticism of medieval Hebrew poetry did not appear ex nihilo, as has been seen. Despite apparent "modernities" or universalisms there are aspects which suggest a certain isolationism. Given the subjectivity of such critical narratives and their expectations of complicity from their nineteenth and twentieth century readers, we may well ask: How evident is this link between "low quality" of literature and the tooth ache in the thought of these critics' contemporaries? The invention of these "evaluations" is a nineteenth-twentieth century phenomenon.

For the twentieth century reading public of literature, themes of toothache and dentition as a whole are by no means obvious signs of decadence and infraliterary quality. It suffices here to recall Theodore Ziolkowski 's study (1976) of dentition as image and metaphor. John Updike, Saul Bellow, Vonnegut are some exponents of literary concerns with odontological material. The theme reappears in different language traditions. The study encompasses Thomas Mann and nineteenth century antecedents – Dostoievsky or Edgar Allan Poe amongst others. Frequently they are metaphors for the state of society. Other remarkable examples could include Robert Burns' "Address to a Toothache": "My curse upon your venom'd stang, /That shoots my tortur'd gums alang," That is to say that the air of sarcasm directed at the medieval Hebrew poet, De Piera, and his choice of subject -his option for the toothache- is inexplicable, unless we entertain the notion that the literary critics concerned with de Piera are writing in isolation from mainstream literature and culture.

II. Pain and literature

Winckelmann, Lessing, Herder, Goethe, Blake, Freud, Curtius discussed the critical theory for understanding the archetypal representation of bodily suffering, the classical *Gruppo del*

Laocoonte. (Richter 1992) The discussion on this theme has by no means abated. Elaine Scarry, in *The Body in Pain: The Making and Unmaking of the World* (1987), begins by discussing the difficulty in expressing pain. She stresses political complications arising from the difficulty and objectification of central attributes of pain. The nature of material and verbal expressibility is linked to a translation of the pain into power. She argues that pain is inherently resistant to and destructive of language/expressibility. Pain is expressed through sensory, affective, and cognitive reactions. It deconstructs language and then rebuilds it – pain, for her, unmakes the world. Physical pain cannot be objectified; but she contends that psychological suffering, though often difficult for any one person to express, does have referential content, is susceptible to verbal objectification. We recognize pain in the weapon, which entails objectifying the pain and holding the referent in place. Pain, like trauma, occurs in a perpetual present/is always "happening". The feeling of pain entails the feeling of being "acted upon". To experience pain is to experience "certainty"; to witness pain is to experience "doubt". She asks: "What is the referent for this pain? The body [material]? Or the feeling of the pain [immaterial]?"

There have been a number of further treatments. Steven Bruhm's study of Romantic literature (1994) draws attention, for example, to the fact that both Radcliffe's and Wordsworth's depictions of terror reduce a dreadful story of past physical suffering to a benign scene of reading. The representation, imagining and expression of pain is not seen by these authors as a "low" realistic activity. Rather it is elevated to a philosophical problem – relations between subject and object, the nature of the material – and a problem of representation.

It is facile to object that they draw their texts from very specific linguistic, geographic and chronological cultural areas. Nevertheless, studies such as these have succeeded in problematizing the projects of representing, or, indeed, reacting to expressions of pain in language as a whole. Years after Scarry, in the field of philosophy of science, Murat Aydede and Güven Güzeldere[6] address toothache as part of their attention to a foundational problem in the scientific study of pain. Their attention to the sensory qualities of pain leads them to the conclusion that it is not homogeneous and simple. Acknowledging the tradition of the introspectionists since the nineteenth century [Titchener, William James, Trigg, Aydede, etc] they affirm that these distinctions later gained neurophysiological support.[7]

III. Medieval pain

The notion that such discussions are impossible in the context of the Middle Ages has no basis.[8] One strand in the writings about toothache is linked to the troubadours' poetry -influential in Spain till the fifteenth century inclusive-. Guillaume de Lorris (ca. 1200 – ca. 1240) was a French scholar and poet from Lorris. He was the author of the first section of the *Roman de la Rose*. He had compared the anguish of unhappy love to toothache: the lover is "*comme ome qui a mal as denz*". The poet from Provence, Peire Vidal (born mid-12th century) was an Old Occitan troubadour. He writes a poem in which he complains about his distress in love by exclaiming "*que*

mals de dens quan dol en la maissela". Renart, in his *Le Lai de l'Ombre,* in the 13th century, wishes to express how far love has imprisioned him: "*m'a Amors en tel point pris* ..." It is worse than a toothache; worse than the pain of pulling teeth- "*barbiers saches les denz ne fu si angoisseus*" The lover's frustration in the courtly code is expressed by images of pain taken from the sphere of toothache. (West 1979)

The notion that the body in pain / toothache is also a medieval question finds support in recent scholarship on medieval texts. The *Vie Seinte Audree* is attributed to Marie de France. There is no doubt that it concerns the representation of pain in the case of toothache: "*si fort avoit la dent dolur*". June Hall McCash (2002) has drawn attention to the "performative verbs" in this vernacular composition which she does not dismiss as example of "low realism". She speaks rather of agonizing pain.[9]

One may recall Marla Carlson (2002) study of medieval spectator response to images of violence in connection with images of St Apollonia (particularly relevant to toothache) or her interest in: how did medieval spectators respond to pain and violence? According to her, the spectacular suffering of saint's plays, like that of public executions and penitential processions, had political consequences; they contributed to the birth of France. *Le Geu Saint Denis* would very likely have been performed in Paris at some point during the first half of the fifteenth century. According to her, there was a change in the representation of Apollonia's torture through teeth pulling: it became slower in the late Middle Ages as did other forms of torture of saints in literary and dramatic representations.[10]

Shelomoh ben Meshullam de Piera belongs in a cultural and historical context, (roughly described as "Christian Spain") - that of the late Middle Ages. Although he is known for his writings, one of the cultural features of his age and his background is that of the visual. Bearing this in mind, it is perhaps possible to offer explanations for the appearance of Hebrew toothache poems around 1400 in the upper echelons of Hispano-Jewish society. One of these new avenues of research would take account of the historical background. The cultural models in these social strata included the royal courts. In the case of royalty in the late fourteenth century and early fifteenth century Crown of Aragon, this implied a court closely connected [dynastically and otherwise] to the royal and noble houses of Valois, Armagnac and de Berry. In the case of the latter one need merely mention the *Tres belles heures du duc de Berry* or other examples of the *Book of Hours* genre to recall the magnificence of the visual art produced by their patronage. Equally important are the concerns with visual arts developed in the contemporary courts of the Crown of Aragon with their rich tapestries on classical themes. In Jewish society this is the age of an explosion of visual art best observed in the illuminations of Hebrew manuscripts. The density of the Jewish presence at these courts and the closeness of contacts with the ruling monarchs and courtiers are solidly documented. (Baer 1929)

In this period, roughly coterminous with Christian Spain in the Middle Ages, the concern with the issues posed by the representation of pain, in our case the toothache, led to the

production of a number of works of visual art. Perhaps the most widely known or disseminated genre is that of the iconography of the above-mentioned St. Apollonia. The instruments of torture, the pliers with which her teeth were extracted are a standard iconographic feature or attribute. The rise of realistic visual representation inspired by scenes of dental pathology or scenes of daily sanitary life in late medieval Europe may be recalled by two examples. The first is in Wells' cathedral chapter, the second in the Portale maggiore of S. Marco in Venice. The first is a sculpture in arenaria rosa. The second is a sculpture of the barber in action.

The Toothache Man is a figure carved as a detail upon a capital in the west bay of the south transept of Wells Cathedral in Somerset. Despite its fame, it appears to be only one out of eleven carvings there of men with toothache from the thirteenth century. It may be linked to the figure of bishop William Button [elected 1267] whose tomb was believed to have the power to relieve toothache. The case of Venice, as Rosen recently wrote, shows the republic at work and could be viewed amongst other perspectives as a case of the depiction of trades.[11] The relief makes explicit reference to the class divide in thirteenth-century Venice. The scene of the barbershop shows the master barber who pries a tooth from the mouth of a squirming young man. The barbers' guild was in fact licensed to perform some minor dentistry, allowing them to keep their shops open on Sundays or feast days to take care of toothaches. This concern with representations of pain in the 13-15th centuries is the broader European context of the Hebrew toothache poems of ca 1400.

The explosion of visual arts patronized by Jews in this period in the case of the Hebrew manuscripts from fourteenth century Aragon, -and the frequently reproduced illuminated Passover Haggadot and bibles are by no means the only examples - shows us the cultural significance of the visual in these Jewish societies. In this period when visual representation grapples with the question of toothache there appear the Hebrew toothache poems.

IV. Toothache

Amongst the poems of that period there are at least two devoted to the topic of toothache.[12] They are part of a poetic correspondence by de Piera with the *Rabbi mayor* of the Jews of Castile ca. 1400, don Meir Alguadex[13]. That is to say that we are dealing with a number of literary compositions on toothache in one and the same chronological, geographic and cultural setting. The rubric informs us of the circumstances. It reads[14]

> ...when I fell ill of the toothache the wonderful scholar the exalted prince don Meir Alguadex sent [the poem] to me as if joking that he had the teeth of lions and the pains of the *lavi*/lion cub. Then I said/replied: [the poem follows][15]

> Perfect in knowledge
> pleasant plant scion of princes
> prince of princes and pleasant ones
> clean of hands and innocent the Lord has oppressed your heart

like the heart of the clouds and the matter of heavens
and would the forms of the creations [yesurot] fom the caves
fear the wounds and bruises
for this your heart is like the heart of the lion
to support the sickness of brothers and friends
even though there are roots of wasting and destruction
the pain as a woman that travaileth
the work of errors
my soul shall not be at risk
from the distress and hardship and the sight of plague
and my organs sink in the trap of pangs
and my muzzle / purposes are broken off
my thoughts are sunk in the mud in the streets
till I change humours [mezagim] for the pains
and I shall change the nature of the sickness
till the tired foundation/root
the cure of the plagues
and the giving of bandage for the wounds of the sick
and my heart's grief shall no longer distress me
and the messenger of the illness shall not pain me
and if your heart is like the rock of my heart
and if your teeth are like the teeth of lions
mine are like the horns of ivory and the crags of rocks

V. Reading toothache

The Hebrew poetics of that period relied of course on a dense texture of selected citations from the Hebrew Bible. We would perhaps expect the fields of teeth mentions in the Bible to be prominently represented in this kind of allusive poem. But, by then, the Bible was not the only source of allusions. Before 1310, in the Crown of Aragon, Ibn Adret [I, 413] was still discussing the old Talmudic (bSab.67) problematics of the fox tooth as talismanic remedy. The renewed interest and availability of such talismans and tooth remedies evidenced in this rabbinical text of the thirteenth/fourteenth centuries may have a historical context. The sale of St Apollonia's teeth as well as their use as relics was not uncommon in the Middle Ages. And yet these traditions are not prominent and seem to have been dismissed in the poem.

The poem is primarily a poem of friendship. This is a well-tried genre of the Hebrew poetry of the Jews of Spain since the tenth century. Its function is to some extent phatic rather than informative. Its purpose is to reassert friendship. The first few lines, therefore, contain a praise of the dedicatee in a kind of apostrophe or vocative mood: "perfect in knowledge/pleasant plant scion of princes/prince of princes and pleasant ones/clean of hands and innocent".

This is not an informative statement; its function is that of communicating. Shipley

(1975), in a study of medieval poetic toothaches, has seen the imagery of illness as grounded in a tradition which sees illness as a reason for communication between two parties. The very act of communication between Alguadex, a court Jew who accompanies the court of the King of Castile, a scholar who "translates" Aristotle's *Ethics* [albeit at several removes,] a physician or writer on medicine and De Piera – who was neither a prominent courtier nor a rabbi – is itself sufficient cause for celebration, speech, poetry. It should be remembered that De Piera is known for his large group of friends and contacts.[16]

There appears, at that moment, an intimation of the negative descriptions which will ensue: "the Lord has oppressed your heart like the heart of the clouds and the matter of heavens". The intimation is rather vague but it is based on a well documented, grand, ancient and medieval cosmic [mythical?] analogy between microcosm and macrocosm. (Rico 1975) Pythagoras had seen the cosmos and the body as a harmonious unity. (Conger 1922) There is in De Piera an analogy between the pain of the human body and the workings of heavens, between the cosmos and man, who in medieval terms was an '*Olam Qatan*', (Cuscito 2018; Saddiq 2003) hence the tacit logic of the cosmic/ Creation analogy which is extended to man's body. De Piera eschews other connotations in the sources, [Talmud] such as organs of the body resembling teeth: *beth shinayyim* is the part of the vagina which has glands in yYeb vi,7b. In bHullin 16b, teeth are aligned with the statement that "the glands of his rectum will fall off". Neither does he mention that [Gen. Rabba 36] Rabbah suffered from toothache for thirteen years. That is to say that he deftly navigates the available sources and expresses his own sensitivity by erasing or selecting some of them.

The language slowly becomes more concrete: "and would the forms of the creations from the caves fear the wounds and bruises". The introduction of "wounds and bruises" transports the reader much closer to the world of disease and pain which is the main theme of the poem, while still retaining the cosmic analogy. He then turns to his addressee: "for this, your heart is like the heart of the lion [*lavi we-laish*] to support the sickness of brothers and friends".

The meaning seems to be that De Piera, in his pain, communicates with his friend, the Chief Rabbi, offering his support and consolation. The association of his friend with the lion, the strongest and most magnanimous of the animals, resonates also with the teeth of the lion, which are a prominent part of the corpus of Hebrew biblical texts/images on teeth. Recent work has clarified the thrust of the image, relating it to an ancient near eastern Wisdom tradition whose existence de Piera would not have fathomed.[17] But the notion that, rather than zoology, there were Wisdom and theology aspects in the Psalms' concern with lions and teeth would not have been alien to him. Nor would the similar use of lion imagery which occurs in Eliphaz's first speech to Job, 4: 7-9: "Consider, what innocent ever perished, or where have the righteous been destroyed? I have observed that they who plow evil and sow trouble reap the same. At a breath of God they perish, A blast of His anger, and they vanish. The lion may roar, the old lion growl, But the young lion's teeth are broken".

By now the mentions of pain become more explicit, frequent and concrete. Thus, the

tooth ache is described by allusion to the '*shod we- shever*', the prophet Isaiah's [59/7] "wasting and destruction" or "ruin and devastation". And then comes the analogy of toothache to birthpangs: "*havalim yeahzukha*" also a citation from Isaiah [13/21] where God threatens to destroy Babylon by the Medes: "And they shall be afraid, pangs and sorrows shall take hold of them *they shall be in pain as a woman that travaileth*." In all of these cases the reference is not to an exclusive tooth ache but to the body in pain or ache in general.

The poet then takes up the theme of the psychological impact of toothache and treats the relation of pain and thought. This is the site of his poetic treatment of the above-mentioned questions of the relation between subject and object; inside and outside; between pain and speech/thought. While the intellectual concerns of Hebrew poetry from medieval Spain are very well attested in general, the precise and specific link to the body in pain even in this case of toothache seems clear: "my soul shall not be at risk from the distress and hardship and the sight of plague and my organs sink in the trap of pangs and my muzzle [or my purposes] are broken off, my thoughts are sunk in the mud in the streets till I change humours [*mezagim*] for the pains".

VI. Toothache in context

The introduction of the Hebrew technical term *mezeg* [humor] is a clear allusion/link to the language of medieval Hebrew medical texts – such as translations of Galen – and their echoes of the humoral theory. Claudius Galen argued that toothaches were caused by acrid and corroding humors irritating the pulp. (Lieber 1981) This also reminds us that by ca. 1400, the *zahut*, "classicist" or "purist" view, that only biblical Hebrew could be used in poetic diction, had long since given way to a more flexible attitude where expressiveness was allowed some linguistic space. The line in the poem becomes somewhat clearer if we learn about the medieval notions of the relation between humors and toothache. Gilbertus Anglicus in ca. 1240 wrote a *Compendium* where he treats this theme. According to Gilbert, toothache was caused by various factors such as imbalance of the four humors: (Anderson 2004) While De Piera's "bandage" recalls the iconic bandage at the above-mentioned Wells' sculpture of toothache, the allusions to the plague could be related to a synonym for illness, or to the Plague of the late 1340s or its recurrences in De Piera's area and period. This is the age which follows the appearance of various dental treatises. Guy de Chauliac wrote a comprehensive treatise which included sections on toothache in Latin in 1363, while he was papal physician at Avignon. John of Gaddesden wrote the *Rosa Anglica* in Latin around 1314 including dental sections:

> till I change humours [mezagim] for the pains
> and I shall change the nature of the sickness
> till the tired foundation/root
> the cure of the plagues
> and the giving of bandage for the wounds of the sick

and my heart's grief shall no longer distress me
and the messenger of the illness shall not pain me

The poem ends with a phatic enunciation of friendship which aligns the heart and the tooth, on the basis of the tooth and passion analogy in the Bible.[18] At the same time it develops and amplifies the possibilities of poetic tooth description. No longer the pearls and coral of the Arabic period[19], the teeth are described by appeal to the field of strength and power, as in the Bible, but with a certain measure of realism:

and if your heart is like the rock of my heart
and if your teeth are like the teeth of lions
mine are like the horns of ivory and the crags of rocks

Readers schooled in the old, classic, Hebrew poetry of the tenth to twelfth century with its universal, communal themes of God, the Universe, Love and Death usually find this kind of poetry distasteful-as has been seen above- and poems such as these seem to them emblematic of the depths of thematic triviality reached by a poetry of decline produced in the fifteenth century, an age of persecution. The recreation of a historical/cultural context in Christian Spain which necessitated some familiarity with its culture[20] seemed inappropriate or inaccessible until relatively recently.

VII. Spanish dentition

The late Middle Ages and particularly the fifteenth century are the frame of the most productive scholarly focus on medieval Spanish *romance* literary dentition. In the *Libro de buen amor* large teeth were a mark of rampant sexuality. Teeth and old age were associated in a poem of the late fifteenth century about an old woman.[21] For them, toothlessness can just be a sign of old age, but even in women it is associated with libidousness, as in the 15th-century poem about the old woman suffering from erotic insomnia.[22] A poem in the *Cancionero de Palacio* is about an old man who is about to marry a poor girl *"aunque le falten dientes /asi no te mordera"*. In the converso Rodrigo Cota's *Dialogo del amor y un viejo,* "Amor" refers to the old man's teeth. Indeed, Calisto's toothache – in Fernando de Rojas' *Tragicomedia de Calixto y Melibea* of ca. 1499 – has given rise to a large critical corpus unsuspected by today's De Piera readers. *Celestina* scholars have referred to this corpus as *inabarcable.* Calisto's toothache in Act IV occurs in a passage where Celestina, who has been referring to his love sickness, talks now of toothache and the remedy is to sing sad songs such as those of that great emperor and musician Hadrian. Given the specific literary frame, a story of a go-between, it is no surprise that there is so much critical emphasis on what is sometimes termed the unseemliness of Calisto's toothache, i.e. the obscene or erotic double entendre on teeth and toothache, its textual and oral folkloric parallels and occasional antecedents [e.g. Boccaccio]. More recently Di Camillo has argued that Sta. Apollonia

had little importance in fifteenth century Spain. He underscores the link to Italian humanists. According to him, the cult of Santa Apollonia and her girdle acquires sexual and blasphemous undertones in the text of the *Celestina*, and may be linked to a religious tradition of the Florentines.[23] However, a study by Santiago Lopez del Rio[24] teaches us that Sta Apollonia, the toothache saint, was not foreign to Spanish mentality. In the Iberian Peninsula there are documents of the fourteenth century about the ancient fraternity of Santa Apollonia in Barcelona. In that century Pedro IV contributed financially to the conclusion of a painted *retablo* about her in the Church of San Carlos in Saragossa. In addition, various other images of Sta Apollonia have survived to the present day. He argues that the advocation of the saint in matters of toothache had to be *frecuentísima* in the Peninsula.

The comparison between the vernacular and the Hebrew traditions helps to delineate more precisely De Piera's rejection of this line of thought in his Hebrew poem to the Rabbi Mayor and to underline the success in lending an air of dignity and the sublime to such an apparently challenging and unpromising theme. And yet, De Piera, as the troubadours and the *Celestina* and its antecedents, relate to toothache in a mood of affect. A common link between the popular and the learned may consist of the focus on age-teeth motifs. These appear, as has been seen, in the vernacular treatments [e.g. Cota] but they are also present in the rubric to the Hebrew poem where there are allusions to the biblical [lion cub] *lavi* vs mature lion pair.

Endnotes:

1. Greif (1918), Tal and Stern (1976). In general, see Micheloni (1977), Samson (1939).
2. Classic studies include Yitzhak Baer (1966, vol 2, 134-137) on Solomon de Piera; Samuel (1937 481-496). Samuel propagated the notion of De Piera and Bonafed as the "last poets of Spain". The unasked questions are whether in the first half of the fifteenth century they knew that they were "the last"; whether this had an effect on their poetry or whether it adds anything to our reading.
3. Brody, (1893); Jarden (1971-1972, 461-465); Bernstein (1936-37, 335-244); Bernstein (1945-46, 1-74); Bernstein (1942); Bernstein (1958, 205-219); Habermann (1964, 24-42).
4. Graetz, (1898, vol IV, 86-87, 140, 240). He also speaks of the "Geschmacklosigkeit und Ueberladung des Dichterlings" as noted by Brody (1893, 5n1).
5. Schirmann-Fleisher (1997, 596).
6. Aydede and Güzeldere (2002, 265-283), Salmi and Vilkama (2014, 59–71).
7. Aydede and Güzeldere (2002, 272n11).
8. Archeologists interested in the fifteenth century have asserted that: "The experience of pain is connected to cultural understanding of the cause of the pain and the relationships between the body and the surrounding world... The osteological record ...together with historical and ethnographic data, gives us an insight into how people thought about dental pain and tried to cure it. The ways in which pain was relieved and treated help us to understand how people thought about the cause of pain and how they understood the human the body in relation to its environment. ...The boundaries between internal and external, as well as emotional and physiological, were thus porous and fluid." Salmi and Vilkama (2014, 68). See also Barthelemy et al (1999, 133-139), DeWitte and Bekvalac (2010, 341-354).
9. McCash (2002, 744-777).
10. Carlson (2001, 7-20); Carlson, "Theorizing Spectator Response to the Body in Pain: Le Geu Saint Denis."

11. Rosen (2008, 54-75); Tigler (1995, 61-151). For the Italian iconography of the saint see Bisogni (1975, 41–47). See also Callahan (1994, 119–138).
12. He also devotes a poem to the pain in his loins and kidneys.
13. For their relations see Bernstein (1958, 205-219). For original documents on Meir ben Shlomo Alguadex, see Leroy (1985, 723-743)
14. On the text see Solomon ben Meshullam de Piera's *Dīwān*, see Bernstein (1942, 46).
15. See the *Diwan*, edited by Bernstein (1942, 115).
16. His contacts include R. Zerahia Halevi Ferrer; Maestre Astruc Rimoch, En Shaltiel Gracian; Don Astruc Crescas from Solsona; Don Noa Chinillo; Don Salomo b. Bechai el Costantin. Amongst the younger ones: En Mose ibn Abbas from Saragossa; Don Shealtiel (Vidal) ihn Labi Bonafoux; En Samuel Bonastruc from Monzon; the brothers Don Samuel and Don Vidal al-Rabbi; Joseph b. Mose Messija [from Ecija?]. See S. Samuel, loc cit.
17. J. J. M. Roberts (1973, 265-267) "..., the poor starving lion of Ps 34, 1 1 is only the pious man's pictorial response to the sceptic's image of the surfeited, steak-gorging lion. In short, the image of the young lions in Ps 34,11, far from being the result of textual corruption, stems from an old pre-Israelite proverbial motif which, if not created by, was at least at home in the wisdom literature, and through this channel Israel inherited it."
18. See Ps 3: "Arise, God! Deliver me, my god! May you strike all my enemies on their cheek, Break the teeth of the wicked" or Ps 58: "God, break their teeth in their mouth; Break off the young lions' fangs...".
19. On teeth in Arabic poetry, see, for example Mohamed A. H. Ahmed (2018). For an earlier, though brief, Hebrew reference to teeth see Alfonso (2006); Prats and Alfonso (2007, 99-123). There are references to loose teeth as signs of death in Samuel Ha-Naggid and to women's teeth as bear's teeth in Al-Harizi, but they are so fleeting and furtive that they cannot be compared to entire poems wholly devoted to tooth ache. Ibn Gabirol famously referred to his bodily pain and illness in his poetry but not to tooth ache.
20. As in those of its *fourth serrana* who had "*dientes anchos e luengos, cavallunos,..*", Ruiz (1974, line 1014G).
21. "non tiene diente ni muela//rumia'l comer como oveja", see Vasvári (2009, 170-181). "Allá irás, doña vieja," in Alin (1968, 332). For somewhat later texts see Larsen (1992, 1116-1121).
22. West (1979, 3-10) "Sospira como moçuela, / Dice que amor le desvela; / Non tiene diente ni muela / Rumia al comer como oveja."
23. Di Camillo (2010, 91-157); Idem (2007, 3-87); Idem (2012, 216-226).
24. Moreno (2008,59-74) and the rich bibliography in the notes; Nagera (1986, 53-4); Gómez Moreno and Jiménez Calvente (1995, 85-104).

References

Ahmed, Mohamed A. H. "An Initial Survey of Arabic Poetry in the Cairo Genizah." *Al-Masāq Journal of the Medieval Mediterranean* 30 (2018): 212-233.

Alfonso, Esperanza. "The body, its organs and senses: a study of metaphor in medieval Hebrew poetry of praise." *Middle Eastern Literatures* Volume 9 (2006): 1-22.

Alin, José María. *El cancionero español de tipo tradicional*. Madrid: Taurus, 1968.

Anderson, T. "Dental treatment in Medieval England." *British Dental Journal* 197 (2004): 419–425.

Aydede, Murat and Güven Güzeldere. "Some Foundational Problems in the Scientific Study of Pain." *Philosophy of Science* 69. 3, (2002): 265-283.

Baer, Fritz. *Die Juden im christlischen Spanien* I, Berlin, 1929.

Baer, Yitzhak. *History of the Jews in Christian Spain*. 2 vols. Philadelphia: Jewish Publication Society, 1960-1966.

Barthelemy I, Telmont N, Crubezy E, Rouge D. "Etude de la pathologie stomatologique et maxillo-faciale

dans une population médiévale (Xe-XIIe siècles) du sud-ouest de la France." *Rev Stomatol Chir Maxillofac* 100.3 (1999): 133-139.

Bernstein, Simon. "Poetic Encomium by Selomoh de Piera to the Rabbi of Castile R. Me'ir Alguadex." *Sinai, Jubilee Volume* (1958): 205-219.

Bernstein, Simon. "Sacral Poetry by R. Selomoh de Piera." *Tarbiz* 7 (1936-37): 335-244.

Bernstein, Simon. "The Dıwan of sacral poetry by R. Selomoh de Piera." Part. II. *HUCA* 19 (1945): 1-74.

Bernstein, Simon. *The Diwan of Selomoh b. Meshullam Dapiera* / Part. I. New York: Alim Publication, 1942.

Bisogni, Fabio. "The Martyrdoms of St. Apollonia in Four Quattrocento Panels." *Studies in the History of Art* 7 (1975): 41–47.

Brody, Heinrich. *Beitrage zu Salomo da-Piera's Leben und Werken nebst Auszugen aus seinem Diwan*, Frankfurt am Main: J. Kauffmann, 1893.

Bruhm, Steven. *Gothic Bodies: The Politics of Pain in Romantic Fiction*. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 1994.

Callahan, Leslie Abend. "The Torture of Saint Apollonia: Deconstructing Fouquet's Martyrdom Stage." *Studies in Iconography* 16 (1994): 119–138.

Carlson, Marla. "Spectator Response to Images of Violence: Seeing Apollonia." *Fifteenth-Century Studies* 27 (2001): 7-20.

Carlson, Marla. "Theorizing Spectator Response to the Body in Pain: Le Geu Saint Denis", http://parnaseo.uv.es/Ars/webelx/Pon%C3%A8ncies%20pdf/Carlson.pdf.

Conger, G. P. *Theories of macrocosms and microcosms in the history of philosophy*. New York: Columbia University Press, 1922.

Cuscito, Giuseppe M. "Microcosmo e macrocosmo nell'ebraismo medioevale: una prospettiva comparatistica." PhD dissertation, Sapienza Università di Roma, 2018.

DeWitte, Sharon N, and Jelena Bekvalac. "Oral health and frailty in the medieval English cemetery of St Mary Graces." *American journal of physical anthropology* 142.3 (2010): 341-354.

Di Camillo, Ottavio. "Algunas consideraciones sobre La Celestina italiana." *Rumbos del hispanismo en el umbral del Cincuentenario de la AIH* 2 (2012): 216-226.

Di Camillo, Ottavio. "Hacia el origen de la Tragicomedia: huellas de la princeps en la traducción al italiano de Alfonso Ordoñez." *Five Hundred Years of Fernando De Rojas' "Tragicomedia de Calisto y Melibea,* ed. Juan Carlos Conde. New York: Hispanic Seminary of Medieval Studies, 2007. 3-87.

Di Camillo, Ottavio. "When and Where Was the First Act of La Celestina Composed? A Reconsideration." *De ninguna cosa es alegre posesiôn sin compania": Estudios celestinescos y medievales en honor del profesor Joseph Thomas Snow*, vol. 1, ed. David Paolini. New York: Estudios Celestinescos, 2010. 91-157.

Gómez Moreno, Ángel and Teresa Jiménez Calvente "A vueltas con Celestina-bruja y el cordón de Melibea." *Revista de Filología Española* 75.1/2 (1995): 85-104.

Graetz, Heinrich. *History of the Jews*. 6 vols. Jewish Publication Society of America: Philadelphia, 1891-1898.

Greif, Samuel. *Dentistry in the Bible and Talmud: A Valuable Contribution to the Early History of Dentistry*. Who's who dental Publishing Company, 1918.

Habermann, A. M. "Iggerot Selomoh de Piera le-Mosheh Abbas." *Osar yehude Sefarad* 7 (1964): 24-42.

Jarden, D. "Seloshah shire kabod w-iedidut haˇdashim li-Shlomoh de Piera". *Yerushalayim* 5-6 (1971-1972): 461-465.

Larsen, Kevin S. ""Estas perfecciones principiaban en los dientes": Dentition in El sombrero de tres picos." *Hispania* 75.5 (1992): 1116-1121.

Leroy, Béatrice. "D'un regne a l'autre: politique er diplomatie des souverains de Navarre dans les annés." *Príncipe de Viana* 46.176 (1985): 723-744.

Lieber, Elinor. "Galen in Hebrew: the transmission of Galen's works in the mediaeval Islamic world." *Galen: Problems and Prospects, Wellcome Institute of the History of Medicine, London* (1981): 167-186.

McCash, June Hall. "La vie seinte Audree: A Fourth Text by Marie de France?" *Speculum* 77. 3 (2002): 744-777.

Micheloni, Placido. *Il mondo dei denti e la sua storia: Dall'epoca gota al seicento*. Vol. 2. TEI Roma, 1977.

Moreno, Santiago López-Ríos. "La oración a Santa Apolonia de la" Celestina" a la luz del folklore médico-religioso." *Theatralia: revista de poética del teatro* 10 (2008): 59-76.

Nagera, F. Vallejo. "Saint Apollonia and her iconography. The windows of Leon Cathedral." *Revista de actualidad estomatologica espanola* 46.354 (1986): 53-54.

Prats, Arturo, and Esperanza Alfonso. "A Hebrew Penitential Poem (Tokhahah) in the Macabre Style." *Medieval Encounters* 14.1 (2007): 99-123.

Richter, Simon. *Laocoon's body and the aesthetics of pain: Winckelmann, Lessing, Herder, Moritz, Goethe*. Detroit: Wayne State University Press, 1992.

Rico, Francisco. *El pequeño mundo del hombre*. Barcelona: Destino, 2005.

Roberts, J. J. M. "The Young Lions of Psalm 34, 11." *Biblica* 54.2 (1973): 265-267.

Rosen, Mark. "The Republic at Work: S. Marco's Reliefs of the Venetian Trades." *The Art Bulletin* 90.1 (2008): 54-75.

Ruiz, Juan. *Libro de buen amor*, ed. Jacques Joset, Madrid: Espasa-Calpe, 1974.

Saddiq, Joseph Ibn. *The microcosm of Joseph Ibn Saddiq / Hebrew text critically edited by Saul Horovitz and provided with an English translation, introduction, and notes by Jacob Haberman*. Madison: Fairleigh Dickinson University Press, 2003.

Salmi, Anna-Kaisa and Rosa Vilkama. "Pain in the Past–Dental Pathology and Pain in the Parish of Ii (Northern Finland) in the 15th and 16th centuries." *Monographs of the Archaeological Society of Finland* 2 (2014): 59-71.

Samson, Edward. *The Immortal Tooth*. London: Bodley Head, 1939.

Samuel, Salomon. "Der Dichter Salomo ben Meschullam Dapiera und die Frage seines Glaubenswechsels." *Monatsschrift für Geschichte und Wissenschaft des Judentums* H. 6 (1937): 481-496.

Scarry, Elaine. *The Body in Pain: The Making and Unmaking of the World*. Oxford: University Press, 1987.

Schirmann, Jefim- Fleischer, Ezra. *The History of Hebrew Poetry in Christian Spain and Southern France.* Jerusalem: Magnes, 1997.

Shipley, George A. "Concerting through Conceit: Unconventional Uses of Conventional Sickness Images in La Celestina." *Modern Language Review* 70 (1975): 324-332.

Tal, M., and N. Stern. "References to dentistry in the Bible and Talmud." *Refu'at Ha-peh Veha-shinayim* 25.1-2 (1976): 11-4.

Tigler, Guido. *Il Portale Maggiore di San Marco a Venezia: Aspetti iconografici e stilistici dei rilievi duecenteschi*. Venice: Istituto Veneto di Scienze, Lettere ed Arti, 1995.

Vasvári, Louise O. "Glosses on the vocabu(r)lario of the Celestina: II. El dolor de muelas de Calisto." *Bulletin of Hispanic Studies* 86. 1, (2009): 170-181.

West, Geoffrey. "The unseemliness of Calisto's toothache." *Celestinesca* 3.1 (1979): 3-10.

Ziolkowski, Theodore. "The telltale teeth: psychodontia to sociodontia." *PMLA* 91.1 (1976): 9-22.